



Staff Report
Administrative Design Review and Conditional Use Permit
Tukwila School District Transportation Building
Prepared April 18, 2017

FILE NUMBER: L17-0006 (Design Review), L17-0007 (CUP)

ASSOCIATED PERMITS: D17-0061

APPLICANT: Lisa Klein, AHBL Inc.

OWNER: Tukwila School District

REQUEST: Type 2 Administrative Design Review approval for construction of a new 2,515 sq. ft. bus driver rest facility for Tukwila School District

LOCATION: 12801 E Marginal Way, Tukwila, WA 98168

COMPREHENSIVE PLAN DESIGNATION: Neighborhood Commercial Center

ZONING DISTRICT: Neighborhood Commercial Center

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW: Exempt

PUBLIC NOTICE: A combined notice of application for design review and conditional use was sent to neighboring residents and businesses on February 27, 2017. A notice was posted onsite on February 27, 2017. The notice of public hearing was published in the Seattle Times on April 13th, 2017.

PUBLIC COMMENT: Two comments received: one letter, one phone call.

STAFF: Max Baker, Assistant Planner

ATTACHMENTS: A. Site and Civil Plan Set
B. Color Elevations
C. Project Description from Applicant
D. Public Comment
E. Materials Board (presented at the hearing)

Findings

Vicinity/Site Description

Project Description

The project seeks to construct a new 2,515 square foot building for daily administrative use by the bus drivers of the Tukwila School District. The building will include a conference/training room, break room, two offices, storage room, mechanical closet, janitorial closet, lobby, and restrooms. The proposed new building will be one story and, with site improvements including landscaping upgrades and restriping of the parking spaces.

Existing Development

The existing site contains a parking lot that is used exclusively for parking of the Tukwila School District's buses and the bus drivers' personal vehicles. A small storage shed and portable toilets, which are proposed to be removed, are the only structures that exist on site. A chain link fence encompasses the parking lot, with two vehicle gates along S 128th St. providing access into the site.



View of existing parking lot from northwest corner of lot (S 128th St.)



View of existing parking lot from northeast corner of lot (E Marginal Way and S 128th St.)



View of existing parking lot from southeast corner of lot (E Marginal Way)

Surrounding Land Use

The project site is bounded to the east by E Marginal Way South and by S 128th Street to the north. Blue Nile Trucking, a truck terminal facility, is located to the north. Directly to the south are single family homes zoned LDR and a vacant lot, zoned NCC. To the west are single family homes. To the southeast at E Marginal Way and S 130th St. are mixed-use commercial buildings containing a small market, café, and retail spaces.



Topography & Vegetation

The parcel is mostly level. The site contains perimeter landscaping.

Access

The site has two vehicular access points, both along S 128th Street. A 5-foot wide sidewalk is located adjacent to both E Marginal Way S and S 128th St. at the back of the curb. Pedestrian access into the bus parking lot is currently through either of the two vehicular access points.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Two public comments were received, one in writing from Brian Kennedy on March 13, 2017 and another as a phone call from Virginia Whitzel on March 2, 2017. Their comment and the applicant's responses are as follows:

Response to Brian Kennedy Letter dated March 13, 2017

The comment letter raised the following concerns:

1. Upkeep of landscaping – Mr. Kennedy commented that many shrubs have been removed. He would prefer indigenous plants that attract birds.
 - a. Applicant response: Ten-foot wide perimeter landscape buffers will be provided, which will improve the aesthetic appearance, buffering and screening of the use to surrounding residences and the right-of-way. City code requires plant materials in the buffer to consist of the following:
 - i. Trees: A mix of deciduous and evergreen trees.
 - ii. One shrub per 7 linear feet to achieve a continuous vertical layer in 3 years.
 - iii. Groundcover of varying heights, colors and textures to achieve 100% coverage within 3 years.

The proposed landscaping will be verified to ensure the plantings are done according to City standards, including the species used. We are planting native plants, in particular Serviceberry, which is a native plant species that's popular with birds. We also have two different huckleberry and Oregon grape plants which produce fruit that attract birds.

2. Parking – He would prefer no street parking.
 - a. Applicant response: Employee parking will be accommodated onsite. The project is providing 25 vehicular parking spaces for bus driver use. There are approximately 18 bus drivers that will be using the new transportation building.
3. Noise and Traffic – Both have consistently increased in the neighborhood over the years and have impacted the livability of the neighborhood.
 - a. Applicant response: The proposal is to provide a new indoor office facility for the transportation staff to improve their daily work life by offering them a place to take a break, use the restroom, eat lunch, etc. There is no additional capacity (i.e. more traffic) that will result from the proposal. The building itself provides offices, restrooms and breakroom facilities none of which will generate any new noise to the neighborhood as these are typical office-type activities that occur indoors. The school buses do cause some noise, however they have been using this site for several years and primarily run during school start and end times. They are required to follow strict protocols to limit idling when not in use. The District has recently purchased new buses that will be replacing the older buses. They will be quieter and reduce emissions. The proposed transportation building is located within the Neighborhood Commercial Center (NCC) zoning district, and is considered a "Conditional use." This means that this use is only approved subject to conditions and mitigation measures that ensure compatibility with surrounding uses.

The proposal will undergo a thorough review regarding its compatibility with the surrounding neighborhood. It is also subject to the design review process, where site design, building design, and landscaping will be evaluated to ensure that it is appropriate for the Neighborhood Commercial Zone and that it is appropriately buffered from nearby residential uses.

Response to Virginia Whitzel phone call dated March 2, 2017

The phone call raised the following concerns:

1. Ms. Whitzel wondered why there wasn't a proposal to site it at the corner of E Marginal Way and S 128th Street. By the conclusion of the call Ms. Whitzel was satisfied that placement in the back corner was appropriate.
 - a. Applicant Response: The building is located in the southwest corner of the property for the several reasons. The primary use of the site is to store school buses. The maneuvering and parking space required for the buses is of priority in site design, all the while minimizing the amount of site redesign required for the addition of a small building. Furthermore, the location in the southwest corner allows the building to setback into the property for greater "eyes" on the bus lot.

REPORT ORGANIZATION

This staff report is divided into two sections. The first section covers the Conditional Use Permit and the second section covers the Design Review decision. Staff's conclusions and recommendations follow each section. The Board of Architectural Review is asked to make a decision on both applications. TMC 18.64 addresses conditional use criteria and TMC 18.60 address design review criteria.

SECTION ONE-CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT

DECISION CRITERIA- CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT

The proposed project must comply with criteria detailed in TMC 18.64.050, (1-5), concerning Conditional Use Permits. Applicant's response to conditional use criteria is attached to this staff report as Attachment C. Staff makes the following findings under the city's Conditional Use Permit criteria (TMC 18.64.050):

(1) The proposed use will not be materially detrimental to the public welfare or injurious to the property or improvements in the vicinity of the proposed use or in the district in which the subject property is situated.

This project complies. The project will not expand the bus parking on site. The proposed building will provide a rest area for Tukwila School District bus drivers between shifts. This structure will eliminate the need for a temporary shed and portable toilet on site, in turn moving activities currently visible to neighborhood to within the proposed building.

(2) The proposed use shall meet or exceed the performance standards that are required in the district it will occupy.

The Development Standards for uses in the Neighborhood Commercial Center (NCC) zone include a maximum height of 35 feet and the following setbacks:

- Front Setback:
 - 6'

- Sides Setback, if any portion of the yard is within 50 feet of LDR, MDR, HDR:
 - Ratio of 1.5:1 setback (for every 1.5 feet of building height, setback 1 foot from property line) with a minimum of 10 feet and a maximum of 20 feet
- Rear Setback, if any portion of the yard is within 50 feet of LDR, MDR, HDR Setbacks:
 - Ratio of 1.5:1 setback (for every 1.5 ft. of bldg. ht., setback 1 ft. from property line) with a 10 foot min. and 20 foot max.

The maximum height of the proposed building is approximately 20.5 feet. The proposed project meets all setback and landscaping requirements of the NCC zone.

(3) The proposed development shall be compatible generally with the surrounding land uses in terms of traffic and pedestrian circulation, building and site design.

This project complies. See Design Review criteria below for more information.

(4) The proposed use shall be in keeping with the goals and policies of the Comprehensive Land Use Policy Plan

This project complies with the following Comprehensive Plan policies:

- 1.6.1 Enhance the pedestrian environment with street improvements that include curbs, sidewalks or trails, and regularly-spaced street trees.
- 1.7.3 Use design guidelines to encourage compatible location and configuration of buildings, parking, recreation areas and pedestrian facilities.
- 1.7.4 Incorporate substantial landscaping both along street frontages and within parking lots in new development and redevelopment when the buildings are not brought up to the back of sidewalk.
- 1.7.8 Require that sites have adequate lighting and are designed using crime-reduction principles to increase safety.
- 4.13.4 Ensure that required replacement trees at maturity will have equivalent or larger canopies than the removed tree(s), except where existing or future infrastructure and/or public or private utilities impede the planting of large trees.
- 7.6.2 In neighborhood commercial developments, harmoniously reflect the scale and architectural details of surrounding residential structures, and encourage non-motorized access.
- 7.6.3 Employ appropriate design elements to blend in with the character of the residential neighborhood.
- 7.6.7 Ensure appropriate structural transitions between commercial and residential zones.

5) All measures have been taken to minimize the possible adverse impacts, which the proposed use may have on the area in which it is located.

The mass, scale and design of the building is consistent with the surrounding residential areas. Additional infill landscaping along the perimeter is proposed. Topography change and landscaping help screen the building from the adjoining single family homes along the south and west of the property.

CONCLUSIONS- CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT

1. The proposed use, a bus parking lot with support structure, will fulfill a need for the Tukwila School District and should have a minimal impact upon the surrounding neighborhood. There is no expansion of the bus parking lot proposed, and no increase in visitors or employees is projected. The proposed transportation building will provide necessary facilities for the school's bus drivers, replacing portable toilets and a dilapidated shed on the site in the process.
2. No increase in parking is proposed, only a reconfiguration of existing parking stalls to accommodate the proposed building.
3. The proposed use will be compatible with the surrounding land uses. The small sized one-story structure and its location in the back corner of the property should keep visual impacts on surrounding residential properties to a minimum, while the improved perimeter landscaping will provide an improved visual buffer of the parking area along the adjacent streets.
4. The proposed use will not conflict with the goals and policies of the Comprehensive Plan. As an accessory use to the Tukwila School District, the bus parking lot and proposed transportation building would provide a necessary function for the City and its schools.

RECOMMENDATIONS-CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT

Staff recommends approval of the Conditional Use Permit.

SECTION TWO-DESIGN REVIEW

This project is subject to Board of Architectural (BAR) design approval under Tukwila Municipal Code (TMC) Section 18.60.030. In the following discussion the Board of Architectural Review criterion is shown below in bold and italics, followed by staff's comments. For the applicant's response to the criteria, see Attachment C.

Design Review Criteria TMC 18.60.050.B Commercial and Light Industrial

The following criteria shall be considered in all cases, except that multi-family and hotel or motel developments shall use the multi-family, hotel and motel design review criteria:

1. RELATIONSHIP OF STRUCTURE TO SITE.

a. The site should be planned to accomplish a desirable transition with streetscape and to provide for adequate landscaping and pedestrian movement.

Proposed changes to the existing pedestrian and vehicular access will work to enhance employee safety by providing great visibility to bus drivers and creating demarcated walkways for those traveling on foot within the parking lot. While locating the office building closer to the corner of E Marginal Way S and S 128th St was initially considered, it was found to not be necessary for a structure of this scale and use type. The applicant provided the following response: "The building is located in the southwest corner of the property for the several reasons. The primary use of the site is to store school buses. The maneuvering and parking space required for the buses is of priority in site design, all the while minimizing the amount of site redesign required for the addition of a small building. Furthermore, the location in the southwest corner allows the building to setback into the

property for greater 'eyes' on the bus lot." Due to the continued primary use of this parcel as a school bus parking lot, the planning department has found this building siting to be appropriate.

b. Parking and service areas should be located, designed and screened to moderate the visual impact of large paved areas.

The existing site is entirely paved with perimeter landscaping. See discussion under landscaping section for landscaping requirements. The service areas are located to minimize visibility and are proposed to be screened by enclosures.

c. The height and scale of each building should be considered in relation to the site.

The scale of the building is in keeping with the surrounding residential areas. The height of the buildings is 20.5 feet and a sloping roof is proposed.

2. RELATIONSHIP OF STRUCTURE AND SITE TO ADJOINING AREA.

a. Harmony of texture, lines and masses is encouraged.

The proposed building is approximately 2,500 square feet. The mass and scale of the building is consistent with the surrounding residential areas. The proposed siding is residential in character. The texture and lines of the proposed materials are harmonious.

b. Appropriate landscape transition to adjoining properties should be provided.

The existing landscaping along the perimeter is preserved to the maximum extent possible. Additional infill landscaping along the perimeter is proposed to meet the TMC 18.52 requirements. Topography change and landscaping help screen the building from the adjoining single family homes along the south and west of the property.

c. Public buildings and structures should be consistent with the established neighborhood character.

The proposed building will be used as an office/administrative building for the Tukwila School District. The building itself has been designed to blend in within the surrounding residential neighborhood. The one story structure is an appropriate massing in the context of the surrounding single-family neighborhood, where many homes are single story homes. The proposed color scheme was selected by the owner from several initial schemes. The darker frame and trim are meant to relate to common neighborhood commercial developments such as coffee houses.

d. Compatibility of vehicular pedestrian circulation patterns and loading facilities in terms of safety, efficiency and convenience should be encouraged.

While it would usually be recommended to locate commercial structure within the Neighborhood Commercial Center district closer to the street's edge, the applicant has proposed the building to be located within the southwest corner of the lot to facilitate the continued function of bus parking and maneuvering on the site. This will improve traffic flow through the site while at the same time reducing the visual impact of the structure on the surrounding neighborhood.

e. Compatibility of on-site vehicular circulation with street circulation should be encouraged.

Painted pedestrian pathways have been provided between the S 128th St. and the transportation building to provide designated walkways for employees, enhancing pedestrian safety at the site. The applicant has placed the entryway to the building in the most central location for the staff, between the bus parking and the staff parking.

3. LANDSCAPING AND SITE TREATMENT

a. Where existing topographic patterns contribute to beauty and utility of a development, they should be recognized, preserved and enhanced.

No changes to site topography are proposed.

b. Grades of walks, parking spaces, terraces and other paved areas should promote safety, and provide an inviting and stable appearance.

Painted pedestrian pathways have been provided between the S 128th St. and the transportation building to provide designated walkways for employees, enhancing pedestrian safety at the site. Main entry and back door both have access ramps. Doorways at Rooms 107 and 113 have a grade that is intended to rise up to the door threshold with the grade sloping away from the building. These two rooms have dropped floor slabs to provide for cart access as required for the building program.

c. Landscape treatment should enhance architectural features, strengthen vistas and important axis, and provide shade.

The project meets the design criteria. City code requires plant materials in the buffer to consist of the following:

- Trees: A mix of deciduous and evergreen trees.
- One shrub per 7 linear feet to achieve a continuous vertical layer in 3 years.
- Groundcover will be of varying heights, colors and textures to achieve 100% coverage within 3 years.

d. In locations where plants will be susceptible to injury by pedestrian or motor traffic, mitigating steps should be taken.

The proposed landscaping will be verified to ensure the plantings are done according to City standards, including the species used. Existing trees will be protected during construction.

e. Where building sites limit planting, the placement of trees or shrubs in paved areas is encouraged.

Per TMC 18.70.090 (B), design review triggers compliance with the City's adopted landscaping requirements. Additionally, the Board of Architectural Review may modify the standards when in their judgement strict compliance with the landscaping standards of the code would create substantial practical difficulties. Due to the continued primary use of this parcel as a school bus parking lot, staff recommends waiver from interior parking lot landscaping requirements due to the need for continued access/movement of buses through the site.

f. Screening of service yards and other places that tend to be unsightly should be accomplished by use of walls, fencing, planting or combination.

Additional infill landscaping along the perimeter is proposed. Topography change and landscaping help screen the site from the adjoining single family homes along the south and west of the property and from E Marginal Way and S 128th St.

g. In areas where general planting will not prosper, other materials such as fences, walls and pavings of wood, brick, stone or gravel may be used.

No such features are proposed.

h. Exterior lighting, when used, should enhance the building design and the adjoining landscape. Lighting standards and fixtures should be of a design and size compatible with the building and adjacent area. Lighting should be shielded, and restrained in design. Excessive brightness and brilliant colors should be avoided.

Six (6) 400 watt light poles currently exist on the site. One of these existing poles is proposed to be relocated to the southern edge of the site to provide lighting for the employee parking area adjacent to the building. Five (5) LED bulbs are proposed for the north elevation of the building. There is adequate lighting throughout the

parking lot and around pedestrian areas into the building. Lights will be shielded downwards and automated to reduce impact to surrounding properties.

4. BUILDING DESIGN.

a. *Architectural style is not restricted; evaluation of a project should be based on quality of its design and relationship to its surroundings.*

While freedom was given to the applicant to design a building that would meet the functional needs of the Tukwila School District employees on site, City staff also worked to ensure that the building's design would be appropriate for the largely residential character of the surrounding neighborhood.

b. *Buildings should be to appropriate scale and in harmony with permanent neighboring developments.*

The building has been designed to blend in within the surrounding residential neighborhood. The one story structure is an appropriate massing in the context of the surrounding single-family neighborhood, where many homes are single story homes.

c. *Building components such as windows, doors, eaves, and parapets should have good proportions and relationship to one another. Building components and ancillary parts shall be consistent with anticipated life of the structure.*

Windows will utilize same materials throughout and will be only one of two sizes along front elevation. Doors, railings, trim, and gutters will be of similar materials and colors.

d. *Colors should be harmonious, with bright or brilliant colors used only for accent.*

The proposed color scheme was selected by the owner from several initial schemes. The darker frame and trim are meant to relate to common neighborhood commercial developments such as coffee houses.

e. *Mechanical equipment or other utility hardware on roof, ground or buildings should be screened from view.*

Trash and mechanical units will be enclosed.

f. *Exterior lighting should be part of the architectural concept. Fixtures, standards, and all exposed accessories should be harmonious with building design.*

Site lighting will consist of existing light poles and new exterior lighting attached to building. Exterior lighting will be WST LED lights with minimalist, trapezoidal shape that will be in harmony with the overall building design. Lights will be shielded downwards and automated to reduce impact to surrounding properties.

g. *Monotony of design in single or multiple building projects should be avoided. Variety of detail, form and siting should be used to provide visual interest.*

Materials are varied between roof, trim, and siding, adding some visual interest. The slanted roofline pitch provides a modern look to an otherwise simple building

5. MISCELLANEOUS STRUCTURES AND STREET FURNITURE.

a. *Miscellaneous structures and street furniture should be designed to be part of the architectural concept of design and landscape. Materials should be compatible with buildings, scale should be appropriate, colors should be in harmony with buildings and surroundings, and proportions should be to scale.*

The mechanical enclosure will abut the main structure, and wall finishes will match. The dumpster and recycling enclosure is proposed to be integral colored concrete masonry units (CMU) with a top cap. No street furniture is proposed.

b. Lighting in connection with miscellaneous structures and street furniture should meet the guidelines applicable to site, landscape and buildings.

No lights for accessory features are proposed.

Conclusions

Structure height, length, and setback requirements are in compliance with the Neighborhood Commercial Center standards.

Landscaping is in compliance with all Tukwila Municipal Code standards. The City's Urban Environmentalist has reviewed and approved proposed plant species, siting and materials to ensure appropriate spacing. The perimeter landscaping follows a coherent design concept, which will soften the impact of the bus parking area on surrounding properties and create a more pedestrian-friendly atmosphere along the adjacent streets.

Mechanical equipment is adequately screened and the screening material is in harmony with the overall design scheme of the building.

No significant changes are proposed to the existing parking, lighting, or vehicular and pedestrian access. Those changes that are proposed will work to improve pedestrian and vehicular circulation within the site itself and provide enhanced lighting for employees onsite.

The renderings demonstrate a cohesive style and quality design with ample modulation, articulation, and attention to detail. The color palette features neutral shades of tan with darker accent colors. Materials are varied between roof, trim, and siding, adding some visual interest. The slanted roofline pitch provides a modern look to an otherwise simple building, while keeping the visual impact on surrounding properties to a minimum.

Recommendations

Staff recommends the approval of the Design Review application and approval of modification from interior parking lot landscaping requirements of TMC 18.52.

Informational Items

1. Any signage that is visible from the right-of-way or adjacent properties shall be reviewed through submittal of a separate sign permit application.
2. Irrigation plans shall be reviewed through submittal of a separate building permit application.
3. A Traffic Concurrency Test Fee and Transportation Impact Fee do not apply to this project as there is no Change of Use.
4. The building address will be required to be posted on the north face of the building.