



City of Tukwila

Jim Haggerton, Mayor

Department of Community Development

Jack Pace, Director

Staff Report
To the Board of Architectural Review
Prepared March 8, 2013

Notification: On February 21, 2013, Notice of Application was distributed to tenants and property owners within 500 feet of the subject property. The Notice of Application was also posted on site. On March 15, 2013, a Notice of Public Hearing was disturbed to all property owners and tenants within 500 feet and the notice was published in the Seattle Times.

File Number: L12-046 (Design Review)

Associated Permits: L06-086 (Design Review) E06-023 (SEPA) L07-044 (Special Permission from the Director) and L08-056 (Major Modification to an approved Design Review Application).

Applicant: Bob Fadden on behalf of Wayne Jones

Request: Construction of a 17,000 square foot commercial structure with associated parking on 2.35 acres within a Commercial/Light Industrial District of the City. The building will be devoted to warehouse and office use. A large parking area for construction equipment will be located in the rear of the building.

Location: 4501 S. 134th Place

Comprehensive Plan Designation: Commercial/Light Industrial (C/LI)

Zoning District: Commercial/Light Industrial (C/LI)

SEPA: Determination: Mitigated Determination of Non-Significance issued June 14, 2007. An addendum to the MDNS was adopted on November 7, 2008.

Staff: Brandon J. Miles, Senior Planner

Recommendation: Approval with conditions

Attachments:

- A. Applicant's Response to Design Review Criteria
- B. Revised Plans (Site Plan, Landscaping Plan, Floor Plans, and Elevations)

BACKGROUND

On July 3, 2007, the City issued a Notice of Decision approving the construction of a two story light industrial/office building at 4501 S. 134th Place South. The Notice of Decision reflected the decision made by the BAR at their June 2007 meeting. The approved building was proposed to have a total square footage of 17,000 square feet. Parking for the proposed building was to be located in front of the building; a large parking area for construction equipment was proposed to be installed in the rear of the building.

On September 26, 2008, the City received a request from the applicant to modify the approved design review plans. The applicant proposed to add a third story on the building. The third story will add approximately 6,000 square feet of new building space. The major modification to the project was approved by the BAR at its December 2007 Regular Meeting.

TMC 18.60.070 (E) specifies that a design review approval shall expire if construction is not commenced within three years of approval. Thus, the December 2008 BAR approval for the 4501 Building expired in December of 2011. In order to proceed with the project, the applicant must submit and have approved a new design review application.

Existing Development

The site is largely undeveloped land. The applicant did install some of the required parking, which was approved in 2008.

It appears that in the past this site had been used as a location for fill. The applicant's geotechnical report (Cornerstone Geotechnical Engineering Report, received by the City on December 11, 2006) indicated a significant amount of fill and other materials at a depth of approximately 10-12 feet. The site also contains deposits of kiln ash which is a heavy metal and is considered a toxic substance by the Washington State Department of Ecology. It appears that the kiln ash migrated onto the site from an adjacent parcel.

The east portion of the property contains a very steep slope (excess of 40 percent). This slope is highly vegetated with mature trees and landscaping.

Along the eastern edge of the property is a portion of Southgate Stream. The stream is in the right of way for S. 134th Place.

The site has a very odd shape. The front portion of the property is narrow, approximately 97 feet wide. The property widens towards the middle and rear of the property.



Topography:

The site has a mix of topography. As noted, the west portion of the property contains a steep slope in excess of 40 percent. No construction activity is proposed on this slope. After the toe of the slope the property generally has a slope of 5 percent. Near S. 134th Place, the slope of the property is generally from 15-17 percent with a down slope towards S. 134th Place South.



Property slope increase from S. 134th Place.

Vegetation:

As noted, the site is undeveloped. Mature landscaping is located on the steep slope on the western portion of the property. Outside of this area, the vegetation consists mainly of shrubs and blackberries. Several medium sized trees are located along S. 134th Place S. These trees are within the buffer area for the stream.

As part of the Special Permission application approved by the City in 2007, the applicant installed vegetation within the buffer of the adjacent type 2 stream.



Stream Located in Front of Property.

Findings-Decision Criteria-Design Review

The project is subject to the design review criteria laid out in Tukwila Municipal Code (TMC) 18.60.050 (B).

In the following discussion, the TMC Design Guidelines are shown below in bold, followed by staff's comments. The applicant's response to the design criteria is included as Attachment A.

1. Relationship of Structure to Site

- A. The site should be planned to accomplish a desirable transition with streetscape and to provide for adequate landscaping and pedestrian movement.**

The applicant is proposing to construct a Light Industrial building within the C/LI district of the City. Vehicular and pedestrian access to the City will be via a private access road. The access road is on an

adjacent parcel and the applicant has obtained an easement to utilize the tract.

A five foot paved pedestrian access will extend from S. 134th Place S to the entrance of the building.

The first 60 feet of the site will be utilized as an enhancement for the stream buffer located in the front of the property. The applicant has completed this enhancement and now within his required monitoring period.



Stream Buffer Enhancement Area

Parking for the proposed building will be located in the front of the building. Perimeter and parking landscaping will be provided in the front portion of the site. Pedestrian connections are not proposed to the surrounding properties. An eight foot tall fence will be constructed to separate the applicant's property from the two neighboring properties. The fence does not meet setbacks. A condition has been placed to address this situation.

B. Parking and service areas should be located, designed, and screened to moderate the visual impact of large paved areas.

The front portion of the property will be utilized for parking. The parking will be screened from S. 134th Place by the 60 foot wetland enhancement area.

A large service area is proposed in the rear of the building. The proposed use for this area is to store contractor equipment (trucks, heavy machines, etc). The building has been positioned to screen the service area from S. 134th Place. The storage area does border Macadam Road South. Macadam Road South is at a significantly higher elevation than the applicant's project. As noted, a large downward slope extends east of Macadam Road South towards the applicant's property. This slope area contains a significant number of mature trees which will be retained as part of this project.

C. The height and scale of each building should be considered in relation to the site.

The C/LI allows a maximum height of 45 feet. The proposed building will have a high point of approximately 32.5 feet. The building will have a street façade of approximately 140 feet. However the visibility of the façade is minimized by the vegetation in the 60 foot stream buffer. The surrounding buildings have a street façade ranging from 120 to 175 feet. The surrounding buildings range in height from 25 to 30 feet in height.

The proposed building may appear taller than the building to the north, but that is because the finish floor elevation of the building to the north is ten feet lower than the applicant's property.

2. Relationship of Structure and Site to Adjoining Areas

A. Harmony on texture, lines, and masses is encouraged

The applicant's building will utilize varying elevations and color. The east elevation for the building includes varying elevations to provide vertical modulation. No vertical modulation is proposed along the west elevation or the south elevation. Minor vertical elevation is proposed along the north elevation. Windows are used on all elevations to provide horizontal modulation. A cornice is provided along the roofline of the entire building. The cornice provides more horizontal modulation for the building.

The building is being developed to provide two separate suite areas. Each suite area would include its own main entrance on the east elevation. The entrances will be recessed back with the 2nd floor extending over the entry doors. This provides a small entry feature for the building.

The main building material is colored concrete. CMU brick is used in the front of the building.

Landscaping is provided directly adjacent to the east elevation of the building. Once mature, this landscaping will visually break up the mass of the front façade of the building.

When the Normed Building was constructed several years ago the City received complaints from the residential neighbors along Macadam Road that the glare from the building's roof was disturbing. The homes along Macadam Road look down upon the commercial/light industrial buildings in the valley. Glare from the proposed 4501 Building may not be an issue given that there is a significant amount of vegetation on the hillside that separates the proposed building from the existing homes. However, a condition has been added.

B. Appropriate landscape transition to adjoining properties should be provided

Upon completion, the landscaping along the north and south property lines will comply with the City's landscaping requirements.

No additional perimeter landscaping will be required on the west property line because this area contains mature landscaping. TMC 18.52 requires 12.5 feet of landscaping along the front property line.

However, since the front portion of the property will contain a 60 foot enhanced stream buffer additional perimeter landscaping is not needed.

C. Public buildings and structures should be consistent with the established neighborhood character.

Not applicable as the applicant's building is not public.

D. Compatibility of vehicular pedestrian circulation patterns and loading facilities in terms of safety, efficiency and convenience should be encouraged.

As noted, access to the site will be via a shared access drive. Access to the parking area is from two curb cuts, one located right off of the access drive and the other when the access drive makes a 90 degree turn. The access drive extends to the rear of the building to provide access to the rear storage area. Most of the parking is isolated from the main access drive. This separation reduces conflicts between users of the parking lot and through traffic on the access drive. Some conflict may exist of users of the parking stalls directly next to the access road. These users would have to back up onto the access drive in order to maneuver on the site. A fire-turn around is provided in the rear of the building. Parking and service areas have been separated from each other.

E. Compatibility of on-site vehicular circulation with street circulation should be encouraged.

The project will utilize an existing access drive and no new access points are proposed along S. 134th Place.

3. Landscaping and Site Treatment

A. Where existing topographic patterns contribute to beauty and utility of a development, they should be recognized, preserved and enhanced.

A significant number of trees will be retained on site after completion of this project. The trees located in the rear of the property along the steep slope will remain and provide an excellent screen for the single family homes along Macadam Road S. The applicant has proposed to retain several trees located along S. 134th Place South, which are located within the buffer area.

There are several trees located off-site directly to the north of the applicant's property. These trees are not going to be removed; however, the grading activity on the site could damage the root system of these trees. Planning staff has provided a condition to address this concern.

B. Grades of walks, parking spaces, terraces and other paved areas should promote safety and provide an inviting and stable appearance.

The site will utilize differing paving materials to differentiate between the pedestrian walkway and drive paths. Additionally, the pedestrian walkway will be slightly higher than the drive path.

C. Landscaping treatment should enhance architectural features, strengthen vistas and important axis, and provide shade.

Building perimeter landscaping is provided along the front of the building. When mature this landscaping will break up the façade of the front portion of the building. The access drive is lined with trees which provide a site entry feature.

D. In locations where plants will be susceptible to injury by pedestrian or motor traffic, mitigation steps should be taken.

The applicant has proposed curbs around all landscaped areas to prevent damage to plantings from automobiles.

E. Where building sites limit planting, the placement of trees or shrubs in paved areas is encouraged.

Landscaped areas have been provided within the parking areas. The landscaped areas comply with the City's requirements for landscaping within parking areas. Landscaped areas will also be provided near the main entrances to the building.

F. Screening of service yards, and other places that tend to be unsightly, should be accomplished by the use of walls, fencing, planting or combination.

The service yard for the site will be located behind the building and thus not visible from S. 134th Place. The topography and trees on the site will screen the service yard from Macadam Road S.

The dumpster will be located along the north property line and will be enclosed with tilt up concrete walls.

G. In areas where general planting will not prosper, other materials such as fences, walls, and paving of wood, brick, stone, or gravel may be used.

This provision is not applicable to this project. The applicant has noted in the narrative, "Gravel will be used in areas where parking overhang will cause planting to be ineffective". However, the landscaping plans make no such indications on where these areas are. The City requires that ground cover achieve 90 percent coverage within three years of planting.

H. Exterior lighting, when used, should enhance the building design and the adjoining landscape. Lighting standards and fixtures should be of a design and size compatible with the building and adjacent area. Lighting should be shielded, and restrained in design. Excessive brightness and brilliant colors should be avoided.

4. Building Design

A. Architectural style is not restricted; evaluation of a project should be based on quality of its design and relationship to its surroundings.

The proposed building is approximately 17,000 square feet in size. The building is two stories and is being built to house two tenants. Large service doors are provided in the front and rear of the site.

The materials for the building are concrete and CMU brick. However, the use of the CMU brick is very limited and will only be used as an accent in the front of the building.

The building has a degree of vertical modulation on the east (front) and north (side) elevation. Windows are used to provide a small amount of horizontal modulation on all elevations.

A cornice is proposed around the entire roof line.

B. Buildings should be appropriate scale and in harmony with permanent neighboring developments.

The surrounding buildings are light industrial in nature. The surrounding buildings have an average height of 29 feet and have street facades ranging in length between 120 and 175 feet. The applicant's proposed building will be approximately 32.5 feet tall and will have a street façade of 140 feet.

C. Building components such as windows, doors, eaves, and parapets should have good proportions and relationship to one another. Building components and ancillary parts shall be consistent with the anticipated life of the structure.

The proposed building will mainly be constructed with colored concrete. A small amount of CMU will be used in the front partition of the building. Windows have been placed in aluminum sash. A cornice has been placed around the top of the parapet. Exterior doors will have a metallic color.

D. Colors should be harmonious, with bright or brilliant colors used for accent.

The building will utilize earth tone colors. The front portion of the building will feature three colors, dark brown is used to create symmetry and two different tan colors are used to provide horizontal modulation.

The other sides of the building will only feature the two tan colors.

The applicant has not included colors for the proposed dumpster enclosure.

E. Mechanical equipment or other utility hardware on roof, ground or buildings should be screened from view.

The mechanical equipment will be screened by the parapet on the roof. The equipment will not be visible from S. 134th Place, since S. 134th Place South is at a down angle from the building. During winter

months, when the trees on the steep slopes are dormant, the mechanical equipment may be visible from Macadam Road S.

F. Exterior lighting should be part of the architectural concept. Fixtures, standards, and all exposed accessories should be harmonious with building design.

The applicant has noted that lighting will be provided on the building, within the service area, and within the parking area. The applicant has proposed “designer flood lights” that will be installed on the building. The applicant has also proposed “ecolum decolum” parking lot lights. These lights will have a square fixture.

G. Monotony of design in single or multiple buildings should be avoided. Variety of detail, form and siting should be used to provide visual interest.

The project proposes both vertical and horizontal modulation. There is only one building proposed, so monotony of design of multiple buildings is not a concern.

5. Miscellaneous Structures and Street Furniture

A. Miscellaneous structures and street furniture should be designed to be part of the architectural concept of design and landscape. Materials should be compatible with buildings, scale should be appropriate, colors should be in harmony with buildings and surroundings, and proportions should be to scale.

The rear portion of the site will be utilized as contractor storage yard. The applicant has proposed to construct a chain link fence around this portion of the property. The fence ranges in size from six feet along Macadam Road South to eight feet along the north and south property lines. A gate will be provided along the access road to restrict access to the rear portion of the property. The site map (sheet A1) notes that the fence will be dark green on the north and south property line. However, no such note is provided for the portion of the fence along Macadam Road South.

TMC 18.52.040 (F) requires that any fence be placed on the interior side of any required landscaping. The landscaping plan (sheet L1) shows that this requirement will be met on the north property line, but not on the south property line.

The City’s Parking requirements also require that bicycle parking be provided for the proposed use. No bicycle parking is shown on the site plan.

B. Lighting in connection with miscellaneous structures and street furniture should meet the guidelines applicable to the site, landscape and buildings.

No street furniture will be provided with this project.

DESIGN REVIEW CONCLUSIONS

Design Review Guidelines

Relationship of Structure to Site:

The proposed development has been designed to meet the functional requirements for this type of land use while being responsive to the special characteristics of the site. The building is proportion to the property size. The new building will meet all required setbacks.

Typically, the City encourages that parking be located in the rear of a site. However, given the odd shape of this property, the uses for the front portion of the property are very limited and thus using this area for parking is appropriate.

Relationship of Structure and Site to Adjoining Areas:

The proposed building's form and scale is in keeping with the existing development in the area. The buildings height and form is consistent with other development in the area.

Landscape and Site Treatment:

The applicant will install landscaping that meets the City's landscaping requirements within the Commercial/Light Industrial Zone. The applicant will install a significant amount of perimeter landscaping and interior landscaping. All landscaped areas will have automatic irrigation and the applicant will be required to maintain the landscaping for the life of the project (TMC 8.28.180).

Building Design:

The proposed building is of comparable scale with buildings in the neighborhood and has been painted with colors that will make it harmonious with adjacent buildings and the hillside behind the building. The design is appropriate for the light industrial nature of the area.

Miscellaneous Structure and Street Furniture:

Given that the rear portion of the site will be utilized for storage it is appropriate to secure the area with fencing. However, the fence needs to comply with the requirement to place the fence on the interior side of the required landscaping. Parameters should also be placed to ensure that the fences do not hinder the ability to maintain the landscaped areas. This can be accomplished by placing gates along the fence line. The fence along Macadam Road should also be dark green.

Bicycle parking is required for the proposed building, but is not shown on the site plan.

Design Review Recommendation

Staff recommends approval of the 4501 Building application with the following conditions:

General

1. The site map shall be updated to show the location of bicycle parking for the site. Per figure 18-7 of Title 18 the site is required to have two bicycle parking stalls. The Director shall approve the location and design of the parking stalls. However, the Director shall not approve a design which will require the removal of any landscaping approved by the Board of Architectural Review.
2. The fence along the south property line shall be placed within the interior of the five foot landscape strip.
3. In order to maintain the north and south landscaped strip, a gate shall be added on the north fence and the south fence.
4. The chain-link fence along Macadam Road South shall be dark green.
5. Barbwire shall not be used on the chain-link fence along Macadam Road South.
6. The concrete walls for the dumpster enclosure shall be painted to match the color of the primary building. The proposed black chain-link fence with wood slats shall be replaced by green chain-link fence (same fencing material as the perimeter fence) with wood slats.
7. The roof shall utilize non-glare finishes and colors.

Landscaping

1. At the time of construction, tree protection fences shall be placed around the trees on the neighboring north property. The fences shall be placed one foot for every inch in height. No grading activity shall occur within these protected areas.
2. All landscaped areas shall have groundcover placement and species selection which allows for 90 percent coverage within three years.
3. All final details of the landscaping plan, including plant species and spacing, shall be approved by the City's Urban Environmentalist prior to issuance of the building permit for the project.